

Contested Colors:
The 28th Virginia Battle Flag in Minnesota

Anna M. Rice

Documentary

Senior Division

A newspaper article led me to the controversial 28th Virginia Regiment's Civil War battle flag. In June 2002, the *Minneapolis Star-Tribune* featured a story about Virginians requesting the return of this flag, which was captured by Minnesotans at Gettysburg. This is an ideal topic because it is an emotional, historical, and ongoing debate over ownership rights. There are passionate people on each side, eager to tell their viewpoints. I am also interested in Minnesota and Civil War history.

The flag is in the Minnesota History Center, so my research started there. I found information about battle flags, particularly this one, and about Minnesotans in the Civil War. Minnesota Historical Society (MHS) librarian and Civil War historian Hamp Smith recommended resources. MHS Deputy Director Ian Stewart showed me correspondence from across the country, which gave insight into many groups' feelings. I saw the flag in its state-of-the-art storage facility, and interviewed curator Adam Scher. Patrick Hill, author of a comprehensive history of the flag, and John Guthmann, a 1st Minnesota reenactor and attorney who has debated this issue, were also interviewed.

From Virginia, I interviewed Chris Caveness, who heads the Committee to Return the Flag. Rebecca Rose, flag curator of Richmond's Museum of the Confederacy (which I visited during this NHD trip), provided their official position. Other Virginia museums were touted as potential flag recipients, so I interviewed John Long, Salem's museum director. The *Western Virginia Journal*, *Richmond Times*, and *Roanoke Times* provided the Southern-based perspective of the debate. I contacted other historical societies, and learned that some Northern states still retain Confederate flags, and some Southern states have Union flags. Many are interested in this debate's outcome; several requested a copy of my documentary.

After collecting 200 images and 5 hours of my own video, selecting only ten minutes' worth is challenging. The documentary category, however, is the best medium for this emotional controversy. The intensity of the interviews is apparent, and pictures of the Civil War are striking. I wrote a six-minute script so the experts had time to present arguments, then selected appropriate pictures and video clips. The documentary was built using Adobe Premier 5.1 and Adobe Photoshop 7.0.

Contested Colors: The 28th Virginia Battle Flag in Minnesota addresses a current topic with historical importance. The Minnesota Historical Society and 28th Virginia reenactors both claim legal and emotional rights to the flag, and responsibility for its care. Politicians, historians, journalists, and people from across the country have joined the battle, which, beneficially, has generated extensive research on the flag and heightened public interest in Civil War history. This controversy, however, has also highlighted the rift remaining between North and South, since people feel a need for reconciliation in the form of this banner, and others feel threatened by its meaning. Each side agrees they have a responsibility to honor those who fought for the flag; the conflict will continue until they agree how to fulfill it.

***** There is a scene after the credits — please continue watching!**

Bibliography

Research Sources, Primary:

Anon. Email to Barbara Averill. 8 Feb. 2000. Ian Stewart files.

This is a letter from an African-American Southerner (no state was specified) asking that the flag not be returned because the current controversy about displaying Confederate flags had caused so much racial tension in the South. This important emotional issue is raised in the documentary.

Archabal, Nina. Director, MHS. Editorial draft. 13 Mar. 2000. Ian Stewart files.

This editorial (published shortly afterward in local newspapers) lists MHS's reasons for keeping the flag. Legal, emotional, and historical reasons are given. These reasons are reflected in this project.

Averill, Barbara. Letter to Stephan Osman. 19 June 1998. John Guthmann files.

This letter is a list of 9 media events in one week about the flag controversy. Radio, TV, and local and national newspapers were interested. This supports the thesis that this topic has generated public interest in this Civil War artifact.

Baasen, Francis. "Letter from the First Minnesota." Saint Paul Pioneer 21 July 1863, morning ed.: 1.

Confirms that 1st Minnesota took only one stand of colors at Gettysburg; earlier reports had stated that 3 were taken. This one is the flag that remains in dispute 140 years later.

Battle flag of the 28th Virginia Infantry. Civil War artifact. 1863. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Object no. 6421.

This is the controversial flag. The actual item appears more frail and faded than in photographs. Most of its holes are insect damage from before it came into MHS care. It was not on public display, but was easily accessible by appointment, and could be photographed (without extra lighting). It was important to view it because both sides are so emotional about it. It is a powerful symbol. Seeing it did make me feel connected to the men who fought at Gettysburg; and made the war seem more recent.

Blake, Walter H. Handgrips: The Story of the Great Gettysburg Reunion. Vineland, NJ: G. E. Smith, 1913.

This is a first-hand account of the Gettysburg battle's 50th reunion. There is a story (p 112–3) about a 28th Virginia veteran encountering 1st Minnesota veterans, and remarking that he was glad they had their flag because they were nice fellows. This is important because it shows that Confederate veterans knew where the flag was, but chose not to ask for it back.

Bond, Daniel. "Reminiscences." Ms. M165. undated [1916?]. Minnesota Historical Society Collections.

This is a first-hand account of a 1st Minnesota veteran who claims Marshall Sherman gathered the battle flag from surrendering rebel soldiers. It is important background about the battle and the flag's capture, but also it shows that the flag was controversial from the start. Mr. Bond is quoted about Sherman in the documentary (pages 96–97).

"By Telegraph: Highly Important News." Saint Paul Pioneer 7 July 1863, morning ed.: 1.

In big letters, this lists important events of the Gettysburg battle, including capture of 20 rebel flags. This supports how captured battle flags were an important mark of success.

Capron, Aldon B., Committee on Military Affairs. Return to the Proper Authorities Certain Union and Confederate Battle Flags. US 58th Cong., 3rd session. H. Rept. 4644. Washington, GPO, 1905. Serial set: 4644.

This is the report accompanying H.J. Res. 217 about return of the flags. It acknowledges that 44 of the flags are not in the War Dept.'s hands (28th Virginia flag is one of them), and have been sent to their state of origin or to their captors. The rest of the report addresses those in storage at the War Dept. This document and Endicott's letter (below) are the basis for the legal dispute over the 28th Virginia flag.

Catalogue: Battle of Gettysburg Panorama. St. Paul: H.H. Gross, 1886.

This includes a fold-out map of the panorama (see Cyclorama), and at #20 Marshall Sherman is depicted capturing the flag, which shows what an important event it was for Minnesotans. The actual flag was displayed at this spectacle.

Caveness, Chris. Letter to Adam Scher, Curator for Military Banners, MHS. 5 May 1998.

This letter is the first formal letter to MHS from the 28th Virginia reenactors' Committee for the Return of the Flag. Before sending this, the Committee conducted extensive legal research on the flag, but it neglected to research the responsibility required for its care because their small group asked for custody of the flag. These legal and care issues are included in this project.

- - -. 28th Virginia Infantry reenactor and Chairman for the Committee for the Return of the Flag.

Telephone Interview 19 Mar. 2003 and various email messages Jan. – Mar. 2003.

Mr. Caveness provided much information on the current activities of the Committee for the Return of the Flag, and on the original 28th Virginia Regiment. He supplied counterpoint to the legal and emotional rights issues covered by this project. He also has managed to get publicity for his cause, and help increase interest in Civil War history.

Coates, H. C. "Glorious Old First Minnesota." Saint Paul Daily Press 25 July 1863. A1.

This relates the important role Minnesotans had in saving the Union at Gettysburg, and their heavy losses. It also announces that Marshall Sherman captured a flag. This supports the thesis that Minnesotans feel they have emotional rights to the flag.

Cole, Art. Email to Minnesota Historical Society. 29 Feb. 2000. Ian Stewart files.

This is one letter, representative of several in Ian Stewart's files (see below), which says the flag should not be returned because reenactors are not Civil War veterans, and the Minnesota soldiers fought bravely for it. This supports the point that the veterans point of view should be considered.

Coleman, Nick. "A Banner Year." St. Paul Pioneer Press 19 June 1998: A1+.

This article describes the history of and current controversy about the 28th Virginia banner. Emotional and legal rights are discussed. This also demonstrates public interest in this topic.

"Complete List of the Casualties in the First Minnesota, at Gettysburg." Saint Paul Pioneer. 18 July 1863.

Out of 325, only 87 remain active. This supports Minnesota's emotional claim to the flag by showing what a brave and costly role the 1st Minnesota played in the battle.

The Confederate Veteran. Nashville. Various volumes, especially 1894 – 1896.

This periodical was written and read by Southern veterans. There are many examples of the association of flags and heroism. For example, vol. 2, no. 4 p 38: "for to lose [flags] is a disgrace, the capture of them an honor" and p 118: "[the flag] is a glorious heritage beyond value." This helps understand the feelings Southern veterans had for their battle flags, supporting Virginia's emotional claims to the flag.

Cong. Rec. 21 Feb. 1905: 3007–3008.

Rep. Capron of Rhode Island (on the behalf of Rep. Lamb of Virginia) asks for and receives unanimous House approval of H. J. Res. 217, which authorizes the return of certain battle flags; sent on for Senate approval.

Cong. Rec. 23 Feb. 1905: 3131.

Sen. Alger of Michigan requests Senate approval on H. J. Res. 217 which authorizes the Union and Confederate battle flags “now in the custody of the War Department” to be returned to their states of origin. It was unanimously approved. This is important because the wording of this clause is the center of the current dispute over legal rights to the 28th Virginia flag.

Cyclorama photograph. St. Paul View Book. St. Paul: Northwestern Photo Co., ca. 1888. 63.

Cycloramas were huge paintings, arranged in a circle, illustrating scenes of the Civil War, and people paid to see them. This depicts Marshall Sherman’s capture of the flag, which supplies a counterpoint to Pvt. Bond’s account (see above), making the flag even more controversial.

Daughters of the Union Veterans with battle flags. Photograph. 1902. Ramsey County Historical Society.

This provides further evidence that the 28th Virginia battle flag was in St. Paul and not still in the custody of the War Department in 1905. It is held on the steps of the old (2nd) State Capitol by Julia Bevans, daughter of a Union Veteran.

Debate about flag, first. Mid-morning. Minnesota Public Radio. KSJN. 22 June 1998.

Adam Scher (see below) provided the historical background, stating that this is a very rare and valuable Gettysburg artifact because the circumstances of its capture are well documented. John Guthmann (see below) defends keeping the flag, and Greg Gallian, Chaplain and Lt. of the 28th VA reenactors, wants the flag returned. They addressed the historical and emotional significance of the flag to their side, as well as legal issues. Many of these issues are presented in this project.

Debate about flag, second. Mid-morning. Minnesota Public Radio. KSJN. 11 Feb. 2000.

Nick Coleman, St. Paul Pioneer Press reporter, advocates returning the flag, and John Guthmann (see below), advocates keeping it. This spirited debate centers on the same issues as the first debate, but Mr. Coleman emphasizes the return as a reconciliatory gesture, and Mr. Guthmann disputes the need for one. This is important as an example of the issues remaining from the War.

Endicott, William C. Captured Battle Flags: Letter from the Secretary of War. 16 Feb. 1888. US 50th Cong., 1st session. Ex. Doc. 163. Washington, GPO, 1888. Serial set: 163.

This is an inventory of the captured battle flags still in the War Dept. in 1888. President Cleveland wants Congress to decide what to do with them. Sherman’s captured flag, no. 58 (like others) is marked: “Supposed to have been loaned and never returned.” This is the basis for the conflict over legal rights to the flag.

“The Fight for the Battle Flag Rages On.” Washington Post 23 Apr. 2000: F1–5.

The history of the flag’s capture is told, and people from both sides of the current controversy are interviewed. Their strong statements provide an excellent example of how emotional the issue is, with the debaters often relying on emotions rather than facts to forward their cause.

First Minnesota Volunteers Reenactors. Internet web-site. <<http://www.firstminnesota.com/index.html>> 3 Jan. 2003 – 23 Mar. 2003.

This displays the 1st Minnesota reenactors’ views on the flag. This is important because reflects the emotional impact of the flag to these historically-aware individuals. It also has a non-scientific visitor’s poll; currently over 70% favor keeping the flag.

The Flags of the Confederate Armies: Returned to the Men Who Bore Them by the United States Government. St. Louis, Buxton and Skinner. 1905.

This book celebrates the return of the flags authorized by the 1905 Joint Resolution. A touching poem is in the introduction. The book itemizes the flags returned, including 11 to Virginia. This demonstrates the emotional side of this issue.

“The First Regiment: The Return Home.” St. Paul Pioneer. 16 Feb. 1864: 1.

A hero's welcome was given to the 1st Minnesota Regiment on their first trip home after Gettysburg. This shows how important this battle was to the people of the state.

Flag captured at Gettysburg by Marshall Sherman of St. Paul. Photograph. 3 July 1863. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: E425.6 r1.

This image shows the newly captured flag, and it is in nearly perfect condition, which refutes the emotional claim of today's 28th Virginia reenactors that it was bullet hole ridden and stained with the blood of Virginians. Today, there is a stain, but no forensic testing has been done.

Fridley, Russell W. Letter to John Melville Jennings, VA Historical Society. 1961 May 1. Ian Stewart files.

This letter is important because it marks the first formal request for the flag. It is a polite refusal from Mr. Fridley, the MHS Director, to a request from the Virginia Historical Society for the battle flag. The reason given is its historical importance to Minnesota.

Gilbert, J. Warren. The Blue and Gray: A History of the conflicts during Lee's Invasion. Gettysburg: Bookmart, 1952.

This collection includes first-hand accounts by General Longstreet (CSA) and Lt. Col. Edmund Rice (Union) about the day of Pickett's Charge. Rice specifically mentions men wearing “the white trefoil,” the 1st Minnesota's emblem, and how they were cheered by the other soldiers, and that battle flags were captured (but not by whom). This shows that third day of battle was important to Minnesota.

Guthmann, John. Attorney and First Minnesota reenactor. Personal Interview. 17 Mar. 2003.

Mr. Guthmann interpreted the legal rights to the flag (primary information), and he also provided historical perspective on the emotional rights to the flag, especially how the veterans felt. This important point is included in the documentary. He brought up the issue of legal standing, disputing the fact that the reenactors have any legal right to request the flag's return.

- - -. Handwritten debate notes. 10 Feb. 2000 and undated. John Guthmann files.

These are the notes that Mr. Guthmann prepared before radio debates (See Debate about flag, first and second). There is much historical information about the flag, as well as legal and emotional analysis of the rights to the flag. These issues are reflected in this project.

Hill, Patrick. Civil War Historian. Personal Interview. 7 Mar. 2003.

Mr. Hill is a Civil War historian and a life-long St. Paul resident. During the interview, he talked about the Civil War and the flag's history as a secondary source; excerpts appear in the documentary. He is listed as a primary source because the flag controversy inspired him to do the most complete study of the battle flag ever (“Colors of Valor” below), which cements the flag in history, no matter the outcome. This supports two major points of this project: the conflict has improved our historical knowledge, and generated public interest in history.

--. "Colors of Valor." Minnesota History Summer 2000: 59–73.

This is the most complete historical research on the 28th VA battle flag and the people whose lives it touched. This is an important resource for this project. While the article is a secondary source, it is listed as primary because the controversy prompted its creation, and it has become an invaluable resource for both sides as they continue to debate.

Hoke, Jacob. The Great Invasion of 1863 or General Lee in Pennsylvania. Dayton: W. J. Shuey, 1887.

This book features an eye-witness account of Pickett's Charge by General Doubleday. There are many references to positions of flags, and the triumph of capturing flags. This demonstrates the military and emotional importance of these pieces of cloth.

Horwitz, Tony. Confederates in the Attic. NY: Pantheon Books. 1998.

The author, as a member of a "hard-core" Confederate reenactors' group, learns the depth of feelings that remain in the South about the Civil War. This is important to understanding the reasons for the conflict over the flag.

Lee, James. Email to Jeanne Hatch, MN Historical Society. 25 Feb. 2003. Ian Stewart files.

This letter from the great-great-grandson of John A. I. Lee, the last 28th Virginia flag bearer, expresses anger that the reenactors have asked for its return because he feels they have turned it into a symbol of hate and racism, which do not represent the ethics of his ancestor. This was quoted in the video.

"Letters to the Editor: Flag controversy offers parents a chance to teach Minnesota history." St. Paul Pioneer Press 20 Mar. 2000: 6A.

These letters offer differing views on the topic, but they are important as examples of increased public interest in Civil War history.

Long, John. Director, Salem Museum, Salem, Virginia. Telephone Interview. 9 Mar. 2003.

Close to where the original 28th Virginia Regiment mustered out, this museum was asked by the reenactors if it could house the battle flag. Mr. Long said they would try if it came to them, but couldn't seek it out because it is a small museum (1 full time employee). The reenactors have since learned that responsible care is important and Salem is not an option anymore.

Madigan, Sean. "Claiming victor's spoils, Ventura won't give Va. Civil War flag." Star Tribune 29 Feb. 2000: A4.

This reports Gov. Ventura's outspoken refusal. It was given at a White House news conference because he was attending a governors' meeting. The Virginia legislature also passed a resolution requesting the flag's return. This demonstrates national public and political interest.

Marshall Sherman's gravesite. Personal visit. Oakland Cemetery, St. Paul. 15 Mar. 2003.

Sherman's tombstone was recently replaced because the original was so weathered it wasn't readable. Interested people raised money for a replacement. This demonstrates the emotional ties Minnesotans still have to the state's first Medal of Honor recipient.

McKelway, Bill. "Company C going back for battle flag." Richmond Times 24 June 1998: D1+.

During the summer of the 135th anniversary of Gettysburg, the article highlighted the 28th Virginia reenactors' trip back to the battle site, and their emotional reasons for wanting the flag back; these are reflected in my documentary.

--. "28th Virginia fights for its flag." Richmond Times 11 July 1998: B1+.

Minnesota has just turned down the 28th Virginia reenactors' first request for the flag, citing legal reasons. Caveness, representing the reenactors, responds with emotional and legal reasons why it should be returned; 1st Minnesota reenactors and the Assistant MN Attorney General give their reasons why it should not. These reasons are discussed in my documentary.

Memorial Day Ceremonies, Oakland Cemetery, St. Paul. 26 May 2003.

This was the 150th anniversary of Oakland cemetery, and the ceremony on Memorial Day was well attended. The 1st Minnesota reenactors marched to the site of the Civil War veterans' graves, playing drum and fife music, and fired a 21 gun salute. American flags had been placed next to all veterans' graves. After the ceremony, which honored veterans from all wars, Patrick Hill guided tours of the gravesites of people involved in the Civil War, including Marshall Sherman and other 1st Minnesota soldiers. This shows the 1st Minnesota and its heroism are still greatly admired.

"Minnesota's Battle Flags." St. Paul Globe 17 May 1896: 8.

Minnesota commissioned an artist to copy the deteriorating Minnesota battle flags in 1895, and he also painted the 28th Virginia flag — further proof that it had left the War Dept. by 1905. It also tells about the capture of the flag, and its appearance at Sherman's funeral. It describes bullet holes and blood stains (not visible in Flag Captured). The article also mentions that Gen. C. C. Andrews tried to get Minnesota battle flags back from Texas. They are still there today.

"Minnesota Votes to Keep the Flag." Roanoke Times 29 Mar. 2001.

<<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/vote.html>> 5 Mar. 2003.

The Minnesota Senate committee voted to ignore the Virginia legislature's request for its return. The 28th reenactors once again claimed the flag was stolen, and hinted at getting Federal support for its return. This is an AP article so it shows national attention being paid to the flag's ownership.

Museum of the Confederacy. Internet site. <<http://www.moc.org/index.85.67/index.html>> 11 Mar. 2003.

This is reported to be best Virginia museum for flag care and restoration, with over 550 flags including two of the 28th Virginia's battle flags. This is important because it shows that Virginia could responsibly care for the flag; however, the special public attention would be less because of the number and historic importance of the rest of its collection.

Pawlenty, Tim, Governor of Minnesota. Letter to Brig. Gen. John S. Brown. 28 Apr. 2003.

General Brown, prompted by the 28th Virginia reenactors, has lately been requesting that the flag be returned to the U. S. Army so that it can be displayed in an Army Military History museum that is planned to be built in Virginia in 2009. Gov. Pawlenty's response firmly turns down Gen. Brown's request, outlining the reasons this flag is so important to Minnesotans. He denies that any of the legislation passed, including the 1905 Resolution, requires the flag to leave Minnesota. Pawlenty also connects the sacrifices of the 1st Minnesota to the Minnesotans fighting in Iraq, giving a current spin to the issue. This letter shows that the new administration is also becoming involved in this debate, so the conflict will continue.

Plummer, John W. "Correspondence: Letter from a Soldier of the First Minnesota." The State Atlas (Minneapolis) 26 Aug. 1863: 2.

An eyewitness account of the Gettysburg battle by a soldier who participated on the second day. This supports Minnesota's emotional reasons for keeping the flag.

Rich, Joseph W. A. Descriptive list of the Confederate Flags in the Possession of Iowa. Iowa City: The State Historical Society of Iowa, 1918.

This describes nine Confederate flags held by Iowa's Historical Society, after the 1905 Joint Resolution. Today, they still have all nine (see Survey). This shows Minnesota is not alone.

Rose, Rebecca. Colours of the Gray: An Illustrated Index of Wartime Flags from the Museum of the Confederacy's Collection. Richmond: The Museum of the Confederacy, 1998.

This is a list of all of the flags in the possession of the Museum of the Confederacy in Richmond, Virginia. It includes two 28th Virginia flags, and at least twelve Union banners.

-- -. Flag Curator, The Museum of the Confederacy. E-mail interviews. Feb. – Jun. 2003.

Ms. Rose provided information about the Museum of the Confederacy's (MoC) views on the 28th Virginia flag controversy. She hopes that the flag could be borrowed at some time to display alongside the other 28th Virginia flags in the museum's collection. Ms. Rose also sent me many newspaper articles about the controversy and a photo of the MoC. MoC's position is that the flag is well taken care of in Minnesota, and it is not advocating the flag's return; however, the MoC believes that if the flag is returned to Virginia, by law (HJR 92, Stat. 43), it must come to them. The museum is not supporting the 28th Virginia reenactors efforts since the reenactors have no legal standing to request the flag. The reenactors also have not contributed to the preservation of the other two 28th Virginia flags in the MoC.

“Saint Paul Matters: The Panorama of the Battle of Gettysburg to be Inspected This Afternoon.” St. Paul Globe 20 Dec. 1886: 2.

This article states that “by special order of the War Department,” Sherman “was allowed to keep the flag.” He loaned it to the cyclorama. This shows that Sherman believed the flag was given — not loaned — to him.

Scher, Adam. Curator, Museum Collections Department, MHS. Personal Interview at MN History Center, artifact storage area. 6 March 2003.

Mr. Scher is a curator for MHS; the 28th Virginia battle flag is in his care. He discussed the care facilities of MHS, and the Museum of the Confederacy in Richmond, and how damaging different factors, such as travel and display, can be to fragile textiles like the flag. The responsibility for proper care of this artifact is an important issue in this conflict.

Scrapbook on the 1st Regiment Minnesota. Compiled by the Minnesota Historical Society, St. Paul. 1897 – 1908.

This is a collection of many articles about the 1st Minnesota. Important to this project is the large volume of clippings honoring them for their Gettysburg deeds and losses, and Sherman for capturing the flag. This supports the MHS position that this state has emotional rights to the flag.

Sergeant (1st MN, anon.). Letter to the editor, dated July, 28, 1863. “Battle of Gettysburg and the First Minnesota.” Saint Paul Pioneer 9 Aug. 1863: 2.

This letter is a first-hand account describing the heroics of the First Minnesota at Gettysburg. These actions provide Minnesotans with emotional and historical reasons for keeping the flag.

Smith, Hamp. Librarian and Civil War Historian, MHS. Personal Interview. 4 March 2003.

Besides pointing me to many sources, Mr. Smith is from the South. He provided the Southern perspective on Civil War history and how it differs from the North, and how the emotional importance of Pickett's charge continues to today.

- “State to Army on return of flag to South: ‘No, sir.’” Minneapolis Star Tribune. 18 June 2002.
Army Gen. John Brown says the Army owns the flag, and wants to display it in an Army museum planned for Virginia. Since then, current Minnesota Gov. Tim Pawlenty has replied (see above), so this conflict is still developing. This article is the one that gave me the idea for this project.
- Steiner, Andy. “Great Debates: Who Owns History.” The History Channel Magazine Mar. 2003: 37–39.
This is a discussion of the 28th Virginia Flag Conflict, and several national and international historians give their differing views in the premier issue of this new periodical. This shows how important and far-reaching this controversy is.
- Stewart, Ian. Letter to Chris Caveness Chairman of 28th VA Reenactors’ Committee for Return of the Flag. 1 Mar. 1999. Ian Stewart files.
This letter responds to Mr. Caveness’s concerns that MHS is not properly caring for the flag. Mr. Stewart defends MHS and its facilities. This shows that responsibility for the flag’s care is a major issue in the debate.
- - -. Deputy Director, MHS. Personal Interview. 11 Mar. 2003.
Mr. Stewart provided the MHS point of view in the controversy. He emphasized the historical importance of the item, and the legal and emotional rights expressed by the many letters he has received recently. He provided me access to them, and they were useful in selecting which were the most important emotional rights to discuss in this short documentary. Some are listed as primary research sources, designated as *Ian Stewart files*.
- Survey of Northern States for Captured Confederate Flags. Email to various Hist. Soc. Mar. 2003.
Curious to know if the 28th VA flag is the last Confederate flag held in the North, I wrote letters to other state historical societies. There are at least 29 more in 7 other states. Iowa has 9.
- “Terrible Slaughter in the First Minnesota.” Saint Paul Pioneer. 9 July 1863.
This announces that there are fewer than 100 left of the 1st Minnesota after Gettysburg. This great toll is why Minnesota veterans felt strongly about keeping the one captured flag.
- “Those Battle Flags.” Editorial. Minneapolis Journal 6 Feb. 1901: 4.
A request that Minnesota’s Civil War battle flags be moved to New York for display in the Grant monument is discussed. This editorial states that they are sacred relics to the people of Minnesota and symbolize their loyalty to the republic; not merely for “sight-seers.” This is important because it reflects how deeply the emotions ran about these flags 35 years after the War.
- Transferring the War Flags from the Old to the New Capitol. St. Paul: Committee on the Flag Day Ceremonies. 14 June 1905.
This booklet, describing a large ceremony, shows what treasured symbols Minnesotan Civil War flags were to the public. This parade was shortly after the 1905 distribution of War Department flags. No mention is made of the 28th Virginia flag.
- Trumbo, Malfourd W. Letter to Nina Archabal [*sic*], MHS Exec. Dir. 15 May 1998. Ian Stewart files.
Senator Trumbo is a Virginia state senator. He asks for the flag to be returned. This demonstrates the political attention this issue has received.
- 28th Virginia Regiment Reenactors. Internet web-site. <<http://www.28thva.org>> 3 Jan. 2003 – 24 Mar. 2003.
This informational site contains the 28th Virginia Regiment reenactors views on the flag. This is important because it reflects the emotional impact of the flag to these historically-aware individuals. The Committee for the Return of the Flag reports its activities here.

“Valuable Relics: Treasured by Col. C. T. Trowbridge — Pieces of Battle Flag.” Minneapolis Journal 30 Mar. 1901: 7.

This describes the efforts of a Southern veteran to retrieve a captured Civil War battle flag from the War Dept. depository. With the help of a U. S. congressman and a War Dept. employee, the flag was located in a jumbled heap of a thousands, and parts of it were cut off and given to the veteran. This is important because it shows how accessible the flags were, and supports the contention that, perhaps, Sherman was given the flag to keep by someone in the War Department.

Ventura, Jesse. Letter to U.S. Senator John Warner of Virginia. 24 July 2002. Ian Stewart files.

A polite letter turning down Virginia’s request for the flag, based on the legal opinion of the Minnesota Attorney General. This shows how legal rights are important in this controversy.

Virginia S. J. Res. 196. Draft. <<http://leg1.state.va.us/cgi-bin/legp504.exe?001+ful+>> 14 Feb. 2000. Ian Stewart files.

The draft of the resolution, which asks for Minnesota to return the flag, addresses legal rights, emotional rights and responsible care. This is important because it provides the official position of the Commonwealth of Virginia on this issue.

Whitney, Joel. Marshall Sherman. Photograph. ca. 1864. Minnesota Historical Society Collections.

Location: por 16023 r2.

This photograph was taken in 1864, before Marshall Sherman lost his leg and had to stop fighting in the war. This shows the battle flag in the background had left the War Department by 1864, and perhaps, never returned.

Wright, James A. Papers. ca. 1909. Minnesota Historical Society Collections.

Wright was a 1st Minnesota Gettysburg veteran who defended against Pickett’s charge. He describes the smoky, confused, and brutal battle. This helps me understand the veterans’ emotions about the capture or loss of a battle flag.

Zogbaum, Rufus. Battle of Gettysburg, July 2, 1863. Oil painting. Governor’s Reception Room, State Capitol, St. Paul.

This painting depicts the 1st Minnesota’s heroic efforts on the 2nd day of Gettysburg. I was first introduced to this painting on a school field trip to the Capitol in fifth grade. Gov. Arne Carlson himself told us the story of the painting. This shows that Minnesota’s soldiers’ efforts were so historically important that they are still honored today as one of the most significant parts of Minnesota state history.

Research Sources, Secondary:

Carley, Kenneth. Minnesota in the Civil War. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2000.

This book, besides providing useful background, portrayed many of the MHS Civil War artifacts and photographs, which was helpful in developing the visual presentation of this project.

Clark, Champ. Gettysburg: The Confederate High Tide (The Civil War series). NY: Time-Life Books, 1985.

A useful straightforward account of Gettysburg that has great photographs and artwork. The 1st Minnesota appears in artwork and text, demonstrating its important contributions.

Clinton, Catherine. Scholastic Encyclopedia of the Civil War. NY: Scholastic, Inc. 1999.

A useful quick reference for the entire war, with many photographs that helped me develop my visual presentation.

Cowie, Anne. "Marshall Sherman and the Civil War. St. Paul's First Medal of Honor Winner." Ramsey County History Fall 1967.

This is one of the rare articles about Marshall Sherman. It is important background information.

Flags of the Confederacy. Internet web-site. <<http://www.ConfederateFlags.org>> 1 Feb. 2003.

This site gives the physical history of Confederate flags: their importance and how they were made, used, and changed. This provided background information, especially that the battle flag in question was issued just weeks before the Gettysburg battle. The 28th Virginia's earliest battle flags were actually Virginia's state flags instead of the Confederate pattern.

Griffith, Paddy. Battle Tactics of the Civil War. New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1989.

This provided background information on how battle flags were used on the field of action.

Haiber, Robert and William. The First Minnesota Regiment at Gettysburg. LaGrangeville, NY: Info Devel Press. 1991.

Discusses the controversy over how many 1st Minnesota men were actually casualties at Gettysburg. Figures range 70% – 82%.

Hemphill, Michael. "The Spoils of War." Roanoke Times. Pt. 1 of series, Capture the Flag. 2 July 2000.

<<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/spoils.html>>

"That July Afternoon." Roanoke Times. Pt. 2 of a series. 3 July 2000.

<<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/july.html>>

"Marshall Sherman's Disputed Legacy." Roanoke Times. Pt. 3 of a series. 4 July 2000.

<<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/legacy.html>> 5 Mar. 2003.

This series, on the anniversary of the Gettysburg battle, provides a balanced view of the issues. It provides a credible Southern view which is important because of my Northern background.

Holcombe, A. History of the First Regiment Minnesota Volunteer Infantry 1861 – 1864. Stillwater, MN: Easton and Masterman Printers, 1916.

A history about the 1st Minnesota, written while some of the veterans were still alive. It reverently speaks of the Gettysburg accomplishments of the regiment.

Imholte, John Quinn. The First Volunteers: History of the First Minnesota Volunteer Regiment 1861 – 1865. Minneapolis: Ross and Haines, Inc. 1963.

This is a useful resource because it tries to provide a factual, not heroic interpretation of the 1st Minnesota's contributions at Gettysburg, which Imholte feels were blown out of proportion.

Kagan, Neil and Harris Andrews, et. al. Editors. An Illustrated History of Courage Under Fire: Great Battles of the Civil War. Birmingham: Oxmoor House, 2000.

This provided background information about the function and emotional importance of battle flags. It also has great artwork, some of which was used in the documentary (see *Video Sources*).

Leehan, Brian. Pale Horse at Plum Run: The First Minnesota at Gettysburg. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2002.

This book contains the recent and expansive research on the 1st Minnesota, focusing on the accounts of men who were actually there, and was useful for understanding the historic events and the emotions of the soldiers. The extensive bibliography was also helpful to this project.

Moe, Richard. The Last Full Measure: The Life and Death of the First Minnesota Volunteers. New York: Avon Books, 1993.

This is a comprehensive history of 1st Minnesota, and their service in many battles, including Gettysburg. It discusses the actions of Marshall Sherman at Gettysburg and later in the war.

Reardon, Carol. Pickett's Charge in History and in Memory. Chapel Hill: Univ. of N. C. Press, 1997.

This book discusses how the veterans felt about the political and emotional issues of returning captured flags. This supports the point that the feelings of Civil War veterans (not reenactors or historians) need to be considered.

Rollins, Richard. The Damned Red Flags of the Rebellion. Redondo Beach, CA: Rank and File Publications. 1997.

This book discusses the importance of battle flags at Gettysburg, as well as the emotional connections to battle flags throughout the war. Many Southern men went to war with people that they knew, and felt very strongly about their state. This produced a great loyalty to their flag. There is a chapter in this book on the capture of the 28th Virginia battle flag.

Skaar, Arnold. "28th Regiment, Virginia Volunteers: Farmers and Shopkeepers." History Museum and Historical Society of Western Virginia Journal Summer 1968: 15–26.

The Museum of Western Virginia kindly sent this and the following rare articles on the 28th Virginia Infantry. This details the first year of Civil War action for this regiment; a year of inadequate food, poor equipment, illness, and indecisive battles. This is useful background.

--. "28th Regiment, Virginia Volunteers: A Rugged Group of Men." History Museum and Historical Society of Western Virginia Journal Winter 1968: 1–11.

This is the history of this regiment the second year through the end of the war. A tough commander, Allen, gets them in fighting shape, but supplies dwindle. Gettysburg takes a severe toll, including Allen. This supports the emotional rights of the "Return the Flag" proponents.

Stanchak, John. Civil War (Eyewitness series). NY: Dorling Kindersley, 2000.

Excellent short descriptions about various aspects of the War with beautiful visuals. Some of the visuals were used in the documentary (see *Video Sources*).

28th Virginia Infantry. 4 Jun. 2003 <http://xroads.virginia.edu/~UG97/flags/28_vai.html>.

This site included information about a 28th Virginia battle flag carried before the contested flag. This flag now resides in the Museum of the Confederacy. The site also recounted the heavy losses suffered by the 28th Virginia, demonstrating why their flags would be important to their descendants.

Wiley, Bell Irwin. The Life of Johnny Reb: the Common Soldier of the Confederacy. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State Univ. Press, 1943.

Describes the tremendous hardships of Confederate soldiers which is very useful background information for understanding the emotional rights to the flag.

Source for bibliography format:

Gibaldi, Joseph. MLA Handbook for Writers of Research Papers. 5th ed. NY: The Modern Language Association of America, 1999.

Video Sources: Listed by section, in order of appearance:

An Old Unreconstructed. Song. Waylon Jennings, Arr. Songs of the Civil War. CD. Columbia, 1991.
This Civil War song tells of Confederate pride in spite of defeat. The drum solo introduction illustrates the title screens throughout the video.

Introduction:

Opening Ceremony. The 2002 Olympic Games. NBC, 2002. Exec. Prod. Dick Ebersol. DVD.
The scene of the September 11th flag being brought into the Olympic Stadium illustrates how symbolic flags are to people.

Butterfield, Dan. Taps. Song. Steve Luck, bugle. Songs of the Civil War. CD. Columbia, 1991.
An American tradition for saluting fallen comrades, it was written in 1862 by a Civil War General as a tribute to the 11,000 soldiers killed in the Seven Days Battle near Richmond. The final notes sound during the opening display of the September 11th flag.

International Stock. Crowd waving flags photograph. Patriotism. By Lucia Raatma. Mankato, MN: Bridgestone Books, 2000. 12.
Illustrates peaceful unity of people under their flag.

Clark, William / Department of the Interior. Iwo Jima flag-raising statue photograph. Our Flag. By Eleanor H. Ayer. Brookfield, CT: Millbrook Press, 1992. 34.
Illustrates importance of flags to soldiers.

Hill, Patrick M. Civil War Historian. Personal Interview. Video by author. 7 Mar. 2003.
Discusses the importance of battle flags, both from a practical and emotional point of view.

Walker, James. Painting. The J. Howard Wert Gettysburg Collection and Civil War Antiquities. Photographed by Larry Sherer. Gettysburg: The Confederate High Tide (The Civil War series). By Champ Clark. Alexandria: Time-Life Books, 1985. 56–57.
Illustrates a smoky battlefield conditions of the Civil War, and a struggle for the colors.

Removal of the battle flags from the old to new Capitol. Photograph. 14 June 1905. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: FM6.141 p9.
This photograph shows MN Civil War veterans parading their battle flags to the new state capitol in 1905, illustrating their emotional importance.

Furling the Flag. Painting. An Illustrated History of Courage Under Fire: Great Battles of the Civil War. By Neil Kagan and Harris Andrews, et. al. Ed. Birmingham: Oxmoor House, 2000. 451.
Illustrates the emotional importance of the battle flag.

Contested Colors:

Battle flag of the 28th Virginia Infantry. Civil War artifact. 1863. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Object no. 6421.
This is the disputed battle flag, and its image is used in several scenes; here, it is behind the matte of the title screen.

Brady, Alexander Ramsey. Photograph. ca. 1863. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: por 11918 p22.

Illustrates new Minnesota statehood, and its first governor Alexander Ramsey.

Officers of 1st Minnesota Volunteers, Camp Stone near Edwards Ferry, Virginia. Photograph. 16 Mar. 1862. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: E425.12 r5.

Illustrates 1st Minnesota troops as first ones to volunteer for the Union.

First Minnesota after battle at Fair Oaks. Photograph. 1862. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: E425.11 r13.

Illustrates 1st Minnesota troops as battle-hardened and experienced after two years in the war.

Gettysburg battlefield today. Map. By Pennsylvania Railroad. ca. 1913. LC Civil War Maps (2nd ed.), 345.5. Call no.: G3824.G3A3 1913 .p4 CW 345.5. Control no.: 99439153. Digital id.: g3824g cw0345500 <http://hdl.loc.gov/loc.gmd/g3824g.cw0345500>.

Illustrates area of the Battle of Gettysburg.

Vannerson, Julian. Portrait of Gen. Robert E. Lee, officer of the Confederate Army. Photograph. 1863. LC Photograph Collection. Id: LC-B81172-001.

<<http://memory.loc.gov/ammem/cwphtml/cwpcap2.html>> 21 Mar. 2003.

Illustrates highest in command for the Army of Northern Virginia at Battle of Gettysburg.

Zogbaum, Rufus. Battle of Gettysburg, July 2, 1863. Oil painting. Governor's Reception Room, State Capitol, St. Paul. 4 Jun. 2003.

This is video of a painting on permanent display in the Governor's Reception Room in Minnesota's State Capitol. This illustrates the continuing importance of the 1st Minnesota's charge on second day of the Gettysburg Battle to state history.

Gardner, Alexander. Gettysburg Pa. Dead soldiers in the wheatfield near the Emmittsburg road.

Photograph. July 1863. Civil War Photographs, 1861-1865. Compiled by Hirst D. Milhollen and Donald Mugridge. Wash., D.C.: LC, 1977. No. 0202. Digital Id: cwph 00881 <http://hdl.loc.gov/loc.pmp/cwph.00881>.

These are photographs of the fallen 1st Minnesota after the second day of Gettysburg. It illustrates the tremendous sacrifice of these men at this pivotal battle.

Coates, H. C. "Glorious Old First Minnesota." Saint Paul Daily Press 25 July 1863. A1.

Illustrates the heroism and sacrifice of the 1st Minnesota at Gettysburg.

Capture of the Flag:

Minnigh, Luther W. The battlefield of Gettysburg, July 1st, 2nd and 3rd, 1863. map. Phila.: Gatchel and Manning. 1905. LC Civil War Maps (2nd ed.), 344. Call no.: G3824.G3S5 1863 .M5 CW 344.

Control no.: 99439143. Digital id.: g3824g cw0344000 <http://hdl.loc.gov/loc.gmd/g3824g.cw0344000>.

Illustrates troop positions during Battle of Gettysburg.

Army of the Potomac flag icon. <<http://www.bigriver.net/ourflag/flag001.html>> 23 Mar. 2003.

Illustrates the 1st Minnesota Co. C position on July 3, 1863, just before the Confederate charge.

Army of Northern Virginia flag icon. <<http://www.csagalleries.com/images/ConfederateFlag.jpg>> 23 Mar. 2003.

Illustrates the 28th Virginia Infantry position on July 3, 1863, just before the Confederate charge.

Rothermel, Peter F. Pickett's Charge. Oil Painting. Collections of the State Museum of Pennsylvania. Civil War (Eyewitness Books series). By John Stanchak. NY: Dorling Kindersley. 2000. 42-3. Illustrates the ferocious hand-to-hand combat at the wall during the Pickett-Pettigrew charge.

Flag captured at Gettysburg by Marshall Sherman of St. Paul. Photograph. 3 July 1863. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: E425.6 r1. This is a photograph of the 28th Virginia flag, taken on or shortly after the day of capture.

John Abbott Independence Lee. Photograph. Jonathan Lee private collection. <<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/images/pages/johnlee.htm>>. 22 Mar. 2003. This is a photograph of the last 28th Virginia flag bearer for the Gettysburg Battle.

Whitney, Joel. Marshall Sherman. Photograph. ca. 1864. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: por 16023 r2. Illustrates Marshall Sherman, the first Minnesotan to touch the flag.

Daniel Bond. Photograph. ca. 1870. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: por 17999 r1. A portrait of a 1st Minnesota Private who claimed that flag was gathered rather than captured.

Cyclorama photograph. St. Paul View Book. St. Paul: Northwestern Photo Co., ca. 1888. 63. Illustrates Marshall Sherman's capture of the flag.

Rebels taken Prisoner. Ink sketch. An Illustrated History of Courage Under Fire: Great Battles of the Civil War. By Neil Kagan and Harris Andrews, et. al. Ed. Birmingham: Oxmoor House, 2000. 236. Illustrates rebel soldiers being taken prisoner, disarmed and without their colors.

Marshall Sherman, seated. Photograph. [late 1860s?]. U.S. Army Military History Institute, Carlisle, PA. "Colors of Valor." By Patrick M. Hill. Minnesota History Summer 2000. 67. Illustrates what happened to Marshall Sherman after the capture of the flag.

28th Virginia Infantry battle flag. Video by author. 4 Mar. 2003. Illustrates the #58 stamped on the flag by the War Department.

Whitney, Joel. Marshall Sherman. Photograph. ca. 1864. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: por 16023 r2. Illustrates that the flag was removed from the War Department before the end of the Civil War.

Daughters of the Union Veterans with battle flags. Photograph. 1902. Ramsey County Historical Society. Illustrates the 28th Virginia battle flag being displayed at various veterans events. In this case, it is held on the steps of the old (2nd) State Capitol by Julia Bevans, daughter of a Union Veteran.

Sherman, Marshall, grave site. Oakland Cemetery, St. Paul. Video by author. 26 May 2003. Illustrates the end of Sherman's life and the transfer of ownership of the flag.

28th Virginia Infantry Reenactors. Photograph, dated 18 Aug. 2002. <http://www.28thva.org/images/WhiteSulphur2002/The28th_3.jpg> 27 Apr. 2002. Illustrates the 28th Virginia infantry reenactors' request for the return of the flag.

Waters, Natalee. Jesse Ventura. Photograph. "The Spoils of War: Battle for the flag's return." By Michael Hemphill. Roanoke Times 2 July 2000. <<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/spoils.html>>. 5 Mar. 2003. Illustrates Minnesota's Governor Ventura's outspoken response to the request for the flag's return.

Battle flag of the 28th Virginia Infantry. Civil War artifact. 1863. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Object no. 6421.
Displays the object of the controversy.

Legal Rights:

Cong. Records of 1905. Video by author at Macalester College Library, St. Paul. 5 Jun 2003.
Video of the 1905 congressional records book closed and open; displays the exact wording of the controversial clause of H. J. Res. 217, concerning return of Civil War battle flags.

Sneden, Robert Knox. Some of the Captured Rebel Flags. Watercolor and Ink sketch. 1892. Virginia Historical Society Collections. Images from the Storm. By Private Robert Knox Sneden. Ed. Charles F. Bryan, Jr., James C. Kelly, and Nelson D. Lankford. NY: Free Press, 2001. 146.
Illustrates War Department's catalog of captured battle flags.

Hill, Patrick M. Civil War Historian. Personal Interview. Video by author. 7 Mar. 2003.
Discusses the history and significance of the "now" clause in H. J. Res. 217.

Caveness, Chris. 28th Virginia Infantry reenactor and Chairman for the Committee for the Return of the Flag. Telephone Interview. 19 Mar. 2003.
Discusses how Minnesota is in violation of the H. J. Res. 217.

Waters, Natalee. Chris Caveness photograph. "Part Two: That July Afternoon." By Michael Hemphill. Roanoke Times 3 July 2000. <<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/july.html>> 5 Mar. 2003.
Illustrates Mr. Caveness's comments (recorded from a telephone interview).

Minnesota State Capitol. Video by author. 15 Mar. 2003.
Illustrates the involvement of both states' legislatures in the controversy.

Practical Responsibility:

Scher, Adam. Curator, Museum Collections Department, MHS. Personal Interview at MN History Center, artifact storage area. Video by author. 6 Mar. 2003.
Displays the 28th Virginia Flag, and discusses the facility's ability to care for the flag.

Flag Storage Area. Photograph. Richmond: Museum of the Confederacy.
<<http://www.moc.org/mflag.htm>> 21 Mar. 2003.
Illustrates the facilities in Virginia, an institution that might house the 28th Virginia Battle flag.

28th Virginia Infantry Flag. 4 Jun. 2003 <http://xroads.virginia.edu/~UG97/flags/28_vai.html>.
This illustrates the fact that two of the 28th Virginia's other flags are at the Museum of the Confederacy in Richmond. This is one of those flags.

28th Virginia Infantry battle flag. Video by author. 4 Mar. 2003.
Illustrates the fragility of the battle flag, making it difficult for small museums to care for it.

Emotional Rights:

- Troiani, Don. Painting. <<http://www.historicalartprints.com>>. Printed in "Marshall Sherman's Disputed Legacy." *Roanoke Times*. 4 July 2000.
<http://www.roanoke.com/foatimes/flag/images/pages/a_fight.htm> 23 Mar. 2003.
This is a painting of a Civil War battle that illustrates the confusion of the battle and bravery of the soldiers.
- Reenacting Pickett's Charge. Photograph. *American Heritage History of the Battle of Gettysburg*. By Craig L. Symonds. NY: Harper Collins, 2001. 287.
Confederate veterans at a Gettysburg reunion. Illustrates emotional importance of Pickett-Pettigrew charge to Confederate veterans.
- Monument to First Minnesota at Gettysburg. Postcard on paper. ca. 1910. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: E425.2 r4.
Illustrates emotional importance of Gettysburg battle to Minnesota.
- Banks, T. W. Slave quarters, Helena, Arkansas. Photograph. 1864. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: E425.11 r38.
Taken while the 6th Minnesota Volunteers were camped in Helena, this illustrates the emotional feelings about racism that this flag, as well as other symbols of the Confederacy, have exposed.
- Stewart, Ian. Deputy Director, MHS. Personal Interview. Video by author. 11 Mar. 2003.
Discusses the emotional response from African-Americans about returning the flag to Virginia.
- Caveness, Chris. 28th Virginia Infantry reenactor and Chairman for the Committee for the Return of the Flag. Telephone Interview. 19 Mar. 2003.
Refutes the idea that the flag is a symbol of racism.
- Waters, Natalee. 28th Virginia Reenactors. Photograph. 3 July 2000.
<<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/images/pages/fire.htm>> 23 Mar. 2003.
Illustrates the recorded comments of Mr. Caveness.
- Five Civil War Veterans, Old Soldiers' Home, Minneapolis. Photograph. 1899. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: E425.3 p24.
Illustrates the discussion of how veterans felt about returning the flag.
- Waters, Natalee. John Abbott Independence Lee. Photograph. Jonathan Lee private collection.
<<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/images/pages/johnlee.htm>>. 22 Mar. 2003.
Illustrates J. A. I. Lee's descendant's opinion that returning the flag would not honor his ancestor.
- Ian Stewart's files of 28th Virginia's flag controversy. Video by author. 22 Mar. 2003.
Illustrates the strong public opinion and interest generated by this controversy.
- Jefferson Davis. Photograph. <<http://www.roanoke.com/roatimes/flag/images/pages/davis.htm>>. 22 Mar. 2003.
Illustrates the President of the Confederacy, who also had an opinion about returning captured flags.
- Guthmann, John. Attorney and First Minnesota reenactor. Personal Interview. 17 Mar. 2003.
Voices a quote from Jefferson Davis; this quote is cited in Readon's *Pickett's Charge*, p.96 (see Research: Secondary Sources).

The Conflict Continues:

Reunion of old First Minnesota Regiment with Governor Alexander Ramsey, Lake Minnetonka.

Photograph. 1888. Minnesota Historical Society Collections. Location: E425.3 p4.

This is Marshall Sherman in his later years, and illustrates the long time since the flag's capture.

Virginia Infantry battle flag. Video by author. 4 Mar. 2003.

Illustrates the battle flag as a symbol of conflict.

Veterans shaking hands at Cemetery Ridge (50th anniversary). Photograph. Gettysburg Commission.

Harrisburg: PA State Archives. RG 25. An Illustrated History of the Civil War: Images of an American Tragedy. By William J. Miller and Brican C. Pohanka. Alexandria, VA: Time-Life, 2000. 439.

Illustrates a hopeful attitude that some good has come of this flag controversy.

Front cover. Minnesota History Summer 2000.

Cover. The Damned Red Flags of the Rebellion. By Richard Rollins. Redondo Beach, CA: Rank and File Publications. 1997.

First page of "Great Debates: Who Owns History." By Andy Steiner. The History Channel Magazine Mar. 2003: 37–39.

Illustrates the careful historical research that has been prompted by this controversy with three items that discuss the 28th Virginia battle flag.

Minnesota History Center, public entrance. Video by author. 15 Mar. 2003.

Illustrates public interest generated in history by this controversy.

Front door of the White House of the Confederacy (now part of the Museum of the Confederacy).

Photograph. The Museum of the Confederacy, Richmond, VA.

Illustrates continuing controversy of where flag belongs by showing its potential future home.

Work, Henry C. Marching Through Georgia. Civil War Song. Songs of the Civil War. CD. CMH Records, Inc. 1991.

This was chosen because it is upbeat, and conveys hope that a solution agreeable to all parties can be reached. On reading the song's history, though, it is about one of the most demoralizing acts toward the Confederacy, William T. Sherman's March to the Sea. So, ironically, instead it highlights one of the reasons for the conflict about the flag.

Scher, Adam. Curator, Museum Collections Department, MHS. Personal Interview at MN History Center, Artifact Storage area. Video by author. 4 Mar. 2003.

Illustrates that the flag remains at Minnesota History Center for now.

Post-Credits Scene:

Display of flag at Minnesota History Center's library. Video by author. 22 Mar. 2003.

Illustrates the flag's accessibility in Minnesota.